

Minutes
West Lafayette Historic Preservation Commission
Certificate of Appropriateness Sub-Committee
Morton Community Center
222 N. Chauncey Avenue
West Lafayette, IN 47906
June 7, 2016

The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Peter Bunder, Chair, who presided.

Present: Peter Bunder, Chris Kulesza, Kurt Wahl, Dale Dixon, Mike Dunkle (applicant), John Wallace (applicant), Gary Schroeder (applicant)
Absent: Jim Sondgeroth, Arnold Sweet

Commissioner Bunder explained the process to the applicants.

519 Evergreen Street

Mr. Wahl took a look at this property. The garage itself is scheduled to be demolished and replaced with a concrete parking pad (using the existing slab as much as he can). After reviewing the property, the garage itself does not appear to have any historic elements or components to it, but it could be original to the property. Mr. Schroeder isn't aware if the garage is original to the property or not. Mr. Schroeder believes the property was built in the 1940's.

Commissioner Bunder isn't sure if tearing down this garage is a positive thing. President Kulesza would like to know a little bit of more information, but doesn't believe the garage is necessarily historic. Both Commissioners believe that this should be seen by the full Commissioner.

Vote: Bunder – No; Kulesza – Yes. This is going to be sent to the full Commission for any approvals or denials.

Mr. Schroeder asked what additional information the Commission would like from him. President Kulesza asked if he could find out if this garage is original to the property or not. Mr. Bunder is hesitant to tear anything down in the neighborhood that will be replaced by a parking lot. Mr. Schroder stated that there really isn't any off street parking and the current garage isn't large enough to get a car in. He also stated that when you do get a car in, it is difficult to see anything when you're backing out due to the proximity the garage is to the street. Mr. Bunder asked regarding Permits. Mr. Schroeder stated that this is possible, however, this is so close to campus that the street parking is very difficult to obtain. Mr. Schroder and Mr. Bunder spoke regarding the zoning requirements for this property and the amount of parking spaces that are required for this property.

443 Robinson Street

Mr. Wahl took a look at this property, which is a very beautiful property. He believes this proposed second floor edition is very fitting. If you look at the other side of the house, there is the second story flat roof that wraps itself around that tends to balance out the whole structure in its entirety. Mr. Wallace built the edition that this second story is going to be on top of 10 years ago. If you take a look, you can see that they worked hard to match the existing building. Mr. Wahl thinks the project is very well put together and the aesthetics of the project are compatible with the structure itself. Mr. Wahl spoke regarding the Secretary of Interior Standards. Mr. Wahl asked that he doesn't match everything exactly so that he's not trying to duplicate what's there. You're able to differentiate the original structure from the new structure. Mr. Bunder stated that the owner of this home was on the original Historic Preservation Commission and he's renovated three existing houses well.

Vote: Bunder – Yes; Kulesza – Yes. This is approved as well as it's done in accordance to Secretary of Interior Standards No. 9.

303 E. Stadium Street

Mr. Wahl stated that this looks like the roof or the entry portion of the house is not changing at all. There is currently 4x4 framing with the carport currently. This applicant would like to fill in the carport and add garage doors to make this a 2 car garage. The siding on this will match the rest of the house. It is machine grooved cedar siding which has been found by the contractor. The contractor wasn't sure exactly what the garage doors will be made out of. He believes it will likely be pre-paneled aluminum doors. Mr. Wahl recommended that the Commission approve this application pending submitting the types of garage doors that are intended to put in. Commissioner Kulesza also asked to add to the motion, that the siding matches the existing siding as well as can be done.

Vote: Bunder – Yes; Kulesza – Yes.

Resolution 2016-1

This Resolution came out of the City of Lafayette due to the fact that our Ordinance is based on the Lafayette Ordinance. This allows the staff member to make certain decisions/approvals without having to go in front of the Committee. Kurt suggested that we strike the first bullet point due to the fact that there is no West Lafayette Historic Preservation Sign Design Guidelines. Mr. Dixon stated that the City Attorney's office was concerned about the second to last point regarding the alteration or removal of a non-original structure. Commission Bunder and Kulesza suggested that we strike that and speak with the Commission or the Lafayette Commission to see why it's done like that and it can be added back in, if needed.

Commissioner Bunder moved that the sub-committee strike the first bullet point and the second to last bullet point. Commissioner Kulesza seconded. Vote: Bunder – Yes, as amended; Kulesza – Yes, as amended.

President Kulesza brought up the torn down garage that wasn't supposed to be torn down. Mr. Wahl believes we approved this as an addition, but not a demolition. Mr. Bunder believes that it was approved to leave the original footprint, but expand off of that footprint. Mr. Wahl stated he was moving the wall 4 feet closer to the house. The roof trusses that he had originally weren't going to do the job and he'd need to add new trusses. Mr. Wahl was under the impression that the three exterior walls were going to remain. Mr. Dixon stated that he spoke with Mr. Spitznagle and other staff members regarding this process. He stated that there are other things going on when it comes to stabilizing the other three walls while this process was ongoing. What they had in the application that went before the Commission was the statement in the garage section that stated "stabilization of existing structure." However, the Deputy Building Commissioner stated that with all of the work going on, stabilizing those other three walls is very difficult to do and may have not been the best choice once the contractor showed up to start doing the work. Mr. Spitznagle believes the roof line and the exterior siding was approved by the Commission. The only thing that is changing is the internal framing that nobody will see when it's finished. The only foul here is that the applicant didn't come back to the HPC or the engineering department and relay the fact they couldn't stabilize those other three walls. Mr. Wahl stated that the structure will look like what was approved when it's finished.

President Kulesza doesn't mind amending the COA to be a demolition, but the owners need to communicate the issues as they come up. This will be discussed again at the next Commission meeting. Mr. Bunder asked if there was a fine on not getting a demolition permit. Mr. Dixon isn't aware of whether or not there is, but he'll follow up with the Engineering Department.

President Kulesza moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Bunder seconded. The sub-committee adjourned at 6:42 p.m.

Peter Bunder, Chair